



Proactive Release

The following Cabinet paper and related Cabinet minutes have been proactively released by the Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet, on behalf of Rt Hon Jacinda Ardern, Prime Minister:

Improving Social Inclusion Post the 15 March Terror Attacks

The following documents have been included in this release:

***Title of paper: Improving Social Inclusion Post the 15 March Terror Attacks
(SWC-19-SUB-0126 refers)***

***Title of minute: Improving Social Inclusion Post the 15 March Terror Attacks
(SWC-19-MIN-0126 refers)***

***Title of minute: Report of the Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee: Period Ended
13 September 2019 (CAB-19-MIN-0472 refers)***

Some parts of these documents would not be appropriate to release and, if requested, would be withheld under the Official Information Act 1982 (the Act). Where this is the case, the relevant section of the Act that would apply has been identified. Where information has been withheld in accordance with section 9 of the Act, no public interest has been identified that would outweigh the reasons for withholding it. In addition, some material has been redacted as out of scope of the release of this Cabinet paper.

Key to redaction code:

- 9(2)(f)(iv), to maintain the confidentiality of advice tendered by or to Ministers and officials.

~~In Confidence~~

Office of the Prime Minister

Chair, Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee

IMPROVING SOCIAL INCLUSION POST THE 15 MARCH TERROR ATTACKS

Proposal

1. Following the 15 March Terror Attacks, the Government's initial focus was on responding to the immediate needs of the victims, their families, and the Muslim community, security concerns and making immediate changes to our gun laws to reduce the likelihood of future incidents.
2. Once the immediate response was in place, calls came from various communities for the Government to assess its role in supporting social inclusion. While this was prompted by the events of 15 March, there are other good reasons for us to consider this, given the growing diversity in New Zealand. We want to support our communities to value and welcome diversity, and to be able to share and discuss sometimes quite different points of view in a constructive and respectful way.
3. I am seeking agreement to leverage existing work and explore some new actions to respond to calls from the communities, and for this work to be delivered through existing publicly-facing work programmes, such as the Child and Youth Wellbeing Strategy.

Executive Summary

4. Demographic changes and migration contribute to increasingly diverse New Zealand communities including ages, cultures, beliefs, abilities, family composition, gender identities, and sexual orientation. This is leading to different viewpoints, and in some cases, divergent views or values.
5. We know that some groups within our communities are not experiencing the same opportunities as others, which may cause resentment and dissatisfaction with how resources are being shared. The events of 15 March exposed both extremism, and the power of communities coming together to support each other.
6. As a Government, we already have a lot of work underway across a range of policy areas to improve social inclusion in our communities, and local government also plays a critical role at a local level. New Zealand is doing well compared to most countries but there are still good reasons to consider if we want to do more. Harnessing the value of diversity can generate benefits for New Zealand, but diversity can also lead to friction and division within communities if there is not sufficient support in place.
7. I asked the Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet (DPMC) to lead some work with the Ministry of Social Development and other agencies to review the evidence on social inclusion, identify the work underway across government, and provide some initial advice on potential interventions to strengthen social inclusion.

8. Following this work, I am proposing to leverage some of our existing work underway, and to bolster this with a small number of new initiatives that I hope will have a significant impact over time. The work is organised around four themes:
 - 8.1. Reduce discrimination in our communities
 - 8.2. Show government and public service leadership on social inclusion
 - 8.3. Support community-based activities that promote an inclusive national identity
 - 8.4. Strengthen our focus on equity and social inclusion in priority work programmes.
9. A separate social inclusion programme is not needed, but I think it would be useful for the Social Wellbeing Committee to retain visibility of this work. This work crosses over a range of portfolios, with a number of Ministers and agencies being responsible for different policies. I have asked the Minister for Social Development to lead the development of a report back on this work later in the year. This report back will include resourcing and may lead to funding being sought in Budget 2020. The Ministry of Social Development (MSD) will play a coordinating role across agencies, and will use its role in communities to identify opportunities and to monitor progress.
10. This complements the work we are doing to eliminate terrorist and violent extremist content online, in line with New Zealand's commitments under the Christchurch Call.

Context

11. Promoting social inclusion is in line with our long-standing approach to preventing and countering all forms of violent extremism – namely supporting the rationale that our counter-terrorism effort needs to start with building resilient, inclusive societies able to resist violent extremist ideologies of any nature.
12. In response to the 15 March Terror Attacks, we have started a number of work programmes to:
 - 12.1. provide support for the victims, their families and the wider Muslim community in New Zealand
 - 12.2. engage tech company and country supporters to progress our commitments under the Christchurch Call to Action to eliminate terrorist and violent extremist content
 - 12.3. strengthen our counter terrorism system
 - 12.4. make changes to our gun policy settings
 - 12.5. set up the Royal Commission of Inquiry into the attacks
 - 12.6. increase the capability and capacity of the Office for Ethnic Communities to improve outcomes for ethnic communities in the medium and longer term
 - 12.7. host dialogues with Muslim and Interfaith leaders, Muslim women and young people.

Operational response

13. While a lot of support has been put in place, agencies will need to provide additional support to the victims, their families, the Muslim and wider community in Christchurch, and the Muslim community nationwide for at least the next twelve to eighteen months.

People in Christchurch have been affected not just by the events of 15 March, but also by the cumulative impact of the Christchurch earthquakes.

14. As part of the immediate response in Christchurch, Minister Woods has initiated some work on building community resilience in the short term. She has asked the Office for Ethnic Communities and MSD to work with the Christchurch City Council to provide support and funding for local community resilience activities in Christchurch. This is an immediate response, with the Office for Ethnic Communities also looking at community development activities in the medium to longer term.
15. In Budget 2019, we also recognised the historical underfunding of the ethnic communities portfolio given the growth in these communities, and invested an additional \$9.4 million to support the Office for Ethnic Communities to promote social cohesion, inclusiveness and diversity.

Calls for more government support for social inclusion

16. In the wake of the 15 March Terror Attack, calls came for the Government to consider initiatives to support social inclusion in communities around New Zealand. In the Christchurch Call to Action, New Zealand has committed to counter the drivers of terrorism and violent extremism by strengthening the resilience and inclusiveness of our societies: this includes through education, building media literacy (to help counter distorted terrorist and violent extremist narratives) and the fight against inequality.
17. While the events of 15 March brought this into sharper focus, there are a range of other reasons why we might want to consider exploring additional work to improve social inclusion in New Zealand. Demographic changes and migration are leading to increasingly diverse communities, different viewpoints, and in some cases, divergent views or values. Some groups within our communities are not experiencing the same opportunities as others, which may cause resentment and dissatisfaction with how resources are being shared.
18. As a Government, we have some substantive programmes underway to address disadvantage and inequality. But given this context, additional support for our communities to acknowledge and welcome diversity, and to be able to share and discuss different points of view in a constructive and respectful way, may be beneficial. I asked officials for some initial advice on improving social inclusion, alongside our work on the Christchurch Call and improving our domestic policy settings.
19. Between mid-April and the beginning of June 2019, MSD, on behalf of agencies, completed an evidence review about how to improve social inclusion (including measures taken post terrorist events, building cohesive communities, migrant and refugee settlement, and working with disaffected and isolated people). MSD engaged with a small number of New Zealand academics and stakeholders to contribute to, and provide feedback on the evidence review. The executive summary is included as Appendix 1.
20. Alongside the development of the evidence review, DPMC worked with government agencies to complete a stocktake of work that is being delivered or under development across government. Agencies were asked to provide information about: existing work across government that directly contributes, could be realigned to directly contribute, or scaled up to improve social inclusion. A summary is included as Appendix 2.

21. Following the completion of the evidence review and stocktake of work across government, DPMC discussed with me some potential options to fill the gaps and leverage existing work to improve social inclusion. These three pieces of advice have informed my thinking about how we might seek to improve social inclusion within New Zealand communities, following the terrible events in Christchurch.
22. Since June 2019, Cabinet has made some decisions that contribute to improving social inclusion including agreeing to:
 - 22.1. expand funding for the 'give nothing to racism' campaign on 24 June 2019 [CAB-19-MIN-0307.01 refers]
 - 22.2. develop an employment strategy action plan for refugees, recent migrants and ethnic communities on 5 August 2019 [CAB-19-MIN-0385 refers]
 - 22.3. expand the welcoming communities programme [CAB-19-MIN-0427 refers].

New Zealand is an increasingly diverse society

23. New Zealand is much more diverse than many people assume, and is becoming increasingly diverse over time. This includes diversity in ages, cultures, beliefs, abilities, family composition, gender identities, and sexual orientation.
24. New Zealand has the fourth highest proportion of overseas born residents among OECD nations, and Auckland has been ranked as the fourth most ethnically diverse city in the world¹. There are 213 different ethnic groups across New Zealand and over 150 languages spoken.
25. The table below shows the projected changes in the population by ethnicity between 2018 and 2038². People can identify with more than one ethnic group.

	2018		2038	
	Number	%	Number	%
European	3,489,100	72%	3,781,400	66%
Māori	765,900	16%	1,059,400	18%
Asian	749,900	15%	1,272,200	22%
Pacific	389,700	8%	590,200	10%
Middle Eastern, Latin American and African	77,500	2%	171,400	3%

26. On our current trajectory, people aged over 65 will outnumber those aged 0 to 14, and Asian communities will outnumber Māori within ten years. In 2038, the median age for those of European ethnicity will be 42.8 years, while the median age for Māori will be 27.9 years.
27. Within 20 years, population growth is forecast to stall or decline in the majority of New Zealand's territorial authorities, Auckland will experience 60% of all population growth, and the number of Indian and Chinese New Zealanders is projected to nearly double.
28. Family and household structures are also becoming more diverse, with increasingly "fuzzy" transitions between life stages leading to more people living in multi-generational households at the same time as there are more people living alone.

1 *World Migration Report 2015: Migrants and Cities: New Partnerships to Manage Mobility*. Geneva; 2015.

2 Stats NZ, Population projections.

Defining social inclusion within a New Zealand context

29. There are many different definitions of social inclusion and no general agreement, across a wide range of literature, about how the concept is defined. For the purpose of this work, officials have used a definition that was developed by the World Bank which captures the key concepts from their discussions.

***Social inclusion** is the process of improving the terms on which individuals and groups take part in society—improving the ability, opportunity, and dignity of those disadvantaged on the basis of their identity³.*

30. Officials have unpacked this further to better define social inclusion in the New Zealand context. Social inclusion is the degree to which:
- 30.1. communities welcome and respect diversity in all forms, and ensure people feel valued and accepted;
 - 30.2. unfairness, prejudice, privilege, discrimination or harmful actions are addressed; and
 - 30.3. people have resources, skills and knowledge to participate meaningfully.
31. The New Zealand context is different to other countries as a result of our history, Te Tiriti, historical and ongoing injustices, and the evolving Maori-Crown relationship.

New Zealand is doing well compared to other countries, but there are still opportunities for improvement

32. New Zealand is doing well compared to other countries. For example, New Zealand ranks second out of 149 nations on its level of acceptance of new migrants living in New Zealand. Nearly 90% of New Zealanders report that they would feel comfortable or very comfortable about a new neighbour who was a different religion or ethnicity to themselves⁴.
33. While New Zealand is doing better than other countries, some groups experience attitudes or behaviours that make them feel less included or valued in our communities. Approximately 17% of New Zealanders report having experienced discrimination in the last twelve months (with higher rates for people aged 15 to 24, women, unemployed people, single parents, recent migrants, Maori, Asians, and disabled people)⁵. There is also anecdotal evidence that rainbow communities experience discrimination.
34. There is also evidence suggestive of structural and institutional racism and discrimination as reflected in long term disparities in education, employment, health, income and justice outcomes⁶.

A rapid review of the evidence shows what interventions impact most positively on social inclusion

35. MSD's review of the evidence identified six ways to strengthen social inclusion:
- 35.1. fostering common values and inclusive social norms
 - 35.2. encouraging and facilitating positive interactions between people

³ World Bank. *Inclusion Matters: The Foundation for Shared Prosperity (Advance Edition)* 2013.

⁴ Stats New Zealand 2018 General Social Survey.

⁵ Stats New Zealand 2016 General Social Survey.

⁶ Human Rights Commission 2012. *A Fair Go for All? Addressing Structural Discrimination in Public Services*.

- 35.3. tackling harms to inclusion (including prejudice, discrimination, and other harmful behaviours)
 - 35.4. supporting people to have the knowledge and skills they need to participate
 - 35.5. supporting people to have a voice and feel heard
 - 35.6. reducing inequality and improving opportunities for people by providing support and resources.
36. The evidence is strongest for encouraging and facilitating positive interactions between people. There was also strong evidence for supporting people to have a voice and feel heard, and for tackling harms to inclusion, including prejudice, discrimination, and other harmful behaviour. International evidence shows that poverty and income inequality are both associated with worse social inclusion outcomes.
37. Fostering common values and social norms is a more subtle and nuanced way to influence social inclusion. This is a longer term strategy that can shift attitudes, but there is also a moderate risk of alienating some people.

There is a lot of activity across government aimed at improving social inclusion and there are some gaps

38. One of the underpinning objectives of social and cultural policy is to improve social inclusion. DPMC encouraged agencies only to include in the stocktake work with a direct contribution to social inclusion, and to leave out anything that only makes a tangential contribution.
39. The stocktake showed that there is a lot of work underway (existing and under development) across government agencies that contributes to improving the social inclusion of New Zealand communities. The scale of the work varies, with some universal and large scale interventions and some small scale trials.
40. Although the working definition of social inclusion is much broader than ethnicity, a lot of the information provided was about policy responses to increasingly multicultural communities and interventions for migrants and refugees.
41. When this existing work is mapped against the six key ways to influence social inclusion based on the evidence review, there is work underway in each area, with more limited activity to foster common values and inclusive social norms, and to support people to have a voice and feel heard.
42. The table on the next page provides a summary of the analysis from the evidence review and stocktake of existing activity to show where there may be benefits from undertaking additional activity to improve social inclusion:

Key way to influence from the evidence review	Strength of evidence	Amount of existing activity	Estimated effectiveness of existing activity	Recommendation
Fostering common values and inclusive social norms	Medium	Low	Unknown	Potential area for intervention, but suggest a cautious approach
Encouraging and facilitating positive	Strongest	Medium	Unknown	High priority for additional intervention and opportunity

interactions				for community-led initiatives
Tackling harms to inclusion	Strong	Medium to High	Low	High priority for additional intervention and could leverage existing initiatives
Supporting people to have the knowledge and skills	Medium	Medium	Medium	Lower priority for additional intervention but opportunity to influence children and young people
Supporting people to have a voice and feel heard	Strong	Low to medium	Low to medium	Potential area for intervention, with opportunity to spread good practice
Reducing inequality and improving opportunities	Strong	Medium	Low to medium	Leverage broader equity programme initiatives and build capability of social agencies

I would like to explore some additional interventions to improve social inclusion, to be delivered through existing public facing work programmes

43. We already have a lot of work in train to support social inclusion. I am proposing to leverage some of our existing work, and to bolster this with a small number of new initiatives with a strong focus on children and young people, that could have a significant impact. I would like to leverage some of our existing activities to:
- 43.1. Reduce discrimination in our communities
 - 43.2. Show government and public service leadership on social inclusion
 - 43.3. Support community-based initiatives that promote an inclusive national identity
 - 43.4. Strengthen our focus on equity and social inclusion in priority work programmes.
44. The table on the next page summarises the interventions. Further work is required, particularly for the new interventions, and could include design, and an assessment of resourcing requirements, costs, benefits and risks.

Theme	Potential interventions
Reduce discrimination in our communities	<p>9(2)(f)(iv)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Expand the 'give nothing to racism' campaign (Justice)
Show government and public service leadership on social inclusion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use PM and Governor General engagement opportunities, and national commemorations, to promote an inclusive national identity and narrative (Arts, Culture and Heritage) • Build on Minister Salesa's interfaith and Muslim dialogues (Ethnic Communities) • Build the capability of the public service frontline to deliver services to our diverse community (State Services) • Increase diversity in public service leadership and frontline roles (State Services) • Government and public service leaders to role model social inclusion (State Services)
Support community-based activities that promote an inclusive national identity	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support community-led initiatives that promote an inclusive national identity (eg Huarahi Hou; Pathway to Treaty-based Multicultural Communities) (Community and Voluntary, Ethnic Communities, Immigration, Social Development) • Increase understanding of local and national history, including Te Tiriti (Arts, Culture and Heritage, Education) • Expand the Welcoming Communities Programme (Immigration)
Strengthen our focus on equity and social inclusion in priority work programmes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Leverage existing equity programmes – welfare overhaul, public housing, Oranga Tamariki, health and disability system review, and education system work programme and apply a stronger social inclusion lens (Children, Social Development, Health, Housing, Education) • Develop employment strategies and action plans tailored for specific groups, including refugees, recent migrants and ethnic communities (Employment) • Strengthening and/or extending refugee support packages, including improving community engagement and family support (Immigration)

We will need some oversight for this work

45. I do not think a stand-alone social inclusion work programme is needed. My preferred approach is to implement further social inclusion actions through existing public-facing work programmes including:
- 45.1. The Child and Youth Wellbeing Strategy
 - 45.2. The Office for Ethnic Communities' work programme
 - 45.3. Strengthening our Counter Terrorism System work programme
 - 45.4. The Education System work programme
 - 45.5. The Employment Strategy
 - 45.6. The Migrant Settlement and Integration Strategy
 - 45.7. The Refugee Settlement Strategy.
46. I think it would be useful to have some light handed ministerial and cross government oversight of this work to ensure we retain visibility over it. I would like the Social Wellbeing Cabinet Committee to maintain oversight of this work, and propose that we

include it in our regular monitoring of the response to the terror attacks for the Cabinet Priorities Committee.

47. The proposed actions cross over a number of Ministerial portfolios and agencies. I have asked the Minister of Social Development to coordinate a report back across all Ministers with responsibility for these actions to seek decisions on the proposed actions once further development and testing has been done. I anticipate that this will be by the end of the calendar year.
48. At the officials' level, there is already a working group, broader cross-agency reference group and a small oversight group that have been established to support the development of the initial advice on this work.
49. I propose that MSD coordinate this work once we have made decisions on this paper. This reflects the relationships and footprint MSD has in local communities, which provides them with the opportunity to work across government agencies and with local government, to understand what is happening in communities, to share information with policy makers and local communities, and to be able to monitor progress.
50. MSD will also work with the Treasury and other agencies to investigate relevant social inclusion indicators, including the wellbeing indicators in the Treasury's Living Standards Framework.

Consultation

51. The Ministry of Social Development; Department of Internal Affairs; Ministry of Education; Ministry of Justice; Office of Disability Issues; Office for Ethnic Communities; Ministry for Women; Ministry for Pacific Peoples; Ministry of Business, Innovation and Employment; Ministry for Culture and Heritage; Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Trade; New Zealand Police; Department of Corrections; Sports New Zealand; the Treasury; Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet (Child Wellbeing, Poverty Reduction, and the National Security Group); and the State Services Commission were consulted on this paper.

Financial Implications

52. As part of the next phase of the work, further work will be completed on detailed design, and an assessment of resourcing requirements, costs, benefits and risks. This work will feed into a Cabinet paper by the end of the year, and additional funding may be sought through Budget 2020.

Legislative Implications

53. There are no direct legislative implications stemming from the policy decisions in this Cabinet paper. If further work indicates legislative change is required, this will be included in the Cabinet paper that will be delivered by the end of December 2019.

Impact Analysis

54. The proposals in this paper do not have any immediate regulatory impacts, but this will continue to be assessed as actions are developed.

Human Rights

55. The proposals in this paper are consistent with the New Zealand Bill of Rights Act 1990 and the Human Rights Act 1993.

Gender Implications

56. Women was one of the groups that has been identified as experiencing higher rates of discrimination. The proposals in this paper contribute to women and girls having the space to confidently voice concerns and needs, and influence decisions as individuals and as part of a collective or community. The proposals in this paper may have a greater positive impact for women.

Disability Perspective

57. Disabled people are not always included in their communities, and experience higher rates of discrimination. The proposals in this paper contribute to giving effect to the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Article 5 of the Convention (Equality and non-discrimination) requires the government to promote equality and eliminate discrimination of disabled people, especially disabled women and children. Article 8 (Awareness-raising) requires the government to promote positive perceptions and greater social awareness towards persons with disabilities. The proposals in this paper may have a greater positive impact for disabled people

Publicity

58. There is no planned publicity for the proposals in this paper.

Proactive Release

59. I do not propose to proactively release this Cabinet paper at this time. I will proactively release it, alongside the next Cabinet paper, in late 2019. This release will be subject to any redactions, in accordance with the Official Information Act 1982 and under the principles in the Privacy Act 1993.

Recommendations

The Prime Minister recommends that the Committee:

1. **note** that demographic changes and migration are contributing to increasingly diverse communities in New Zealand;
2. **note** that the Government already has a lot of work underway across a range of policy areas to improve social inclusion across New Zealand;
3. **note** that there are reasons to consider if we want to do more post the events of 15 March, including in the context of the commitments the Government has made in the Christchurch Call Action to Eliminate Terrorist and Violent Extremist Content online;
4. **note** that the Prime Minister asked the Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet to lead some work to review the evidence on social inclusion, identify work underway across government, and provide some advice on potential interventions to strengthen social inclusion;
5. **agree** to leverage some of our existing interventions to:
 - 5.1. reduce discrimination in our communities;
 - 5.2. show government and public service leadership on social inclusion;

- 5.3. support community-based activities that promote an inclusive national identity; and
- 5.4. strengthen our focus on equity and social inclusion in priority work programmes;
6. **note** that Cabinet has already approved some of these interventions, including expanding funding for the 'give nothing to racism' campaign, expanding the welcoming communities programme, and the development of an employment strategy action plan for refugees, recent migrants and ethnic communities;
7. 9(2)(f)(iv)
- 7.4. increasing understanding of local and national history;
8. **invite** the Minister of Social Development to lead the development of a report back, with all Ministers responsible for actions identified in recommendations 5, 6, and 7, to the Social Wellbeing Cabinet Committee by the end of 2019, on progress including design, and an assessment of resourcing, costs, benefits and risks of additional interventions;
9. **agree** that the Social Wellbeing Cabinet Committee will maintain oversight of this work;
10. **agree** to include this work in our regular monitoring of our response to the 15 March Terror Attacks for the Cabinet Priorities Committee; and
11. **note** that the Ministry of Social Development will coordinate this work following decisions on this paper.

Authorised for lodgement
Rt Hon Jacinda Ardern
Prime Minister

Appendix 1: Executive Summary of the Rapid Evidence Review

Executive summary

This rapid evidence review summarises New Zealand and international evidence about the process of building social inclusion. The review aims to contribute to the evidence base needed to help make New Zealand more socially inclusive, and is structured around answering five main questions:

- What is social inclusion?
- Why is it important?
- What do we know about the extent of diversity and social inclusion in New Zealand?
- How can we build a more socially inclusive New Zealand?
- What do we need to understand better?

It is important to define social inclusion to help clarify the problem we are trying to solve. Although there are a range of definitions, for the purposes of this review we follow the World Bank in defining social inclusion as the process of improving the terms on which individuals and groups take part in society — improving the ability, opportunity, and dignity of those disadvantaged on the basis of their identity. In the context of New Zealand we take this to mean that social inclusion refers to the degree to which:

- communities across New Zealand embrace diversity and ensure all people feel recognised and accepted
- people are free from prejudice and discrimination
- people have resources, skills and knowledge to meaningfully participate.

The New Zealand context is also unique in a number of ways that are important when interpreting and applying the evidence about social inclusion, especially from overseas. In particular, the nation's bicultural foundations, the historical and ongoing injustices towards tangata whenua, and the evolving Māori-Crown partnership, are the fundamental starting point for understanding social inclusion in Aotearoa New Zealand.

Another distinctive feature of the New Zealand context is the astonishing pace and scale of recent social change — that is projected to continue apace for at least the next twenty years. Not only is New Zealand one of the most culturally diverse nations in the world, but there is an increasing awareness that social diversity in all its forms is becoming more complex, cross-cutting and interconnected. At the same time as these changes are occurring, many groups are being left behind, as evidenced by consistent and systematic disparities: in health, education, justice and other wellbeing outcomes; in people's experience of prejudice and discrimination; and in wider societal attitudes towards different social groups.

Mindful of this context, the present review identifies evidence for six key ways to help make New Zealand more socially inclusive:

1. **Fostering common values and inclusive social norms.** Leaders at all levels can support an important and ongoing national conversation about New Zealand's values and norms, including the value of protecting and celebrating diversity and upholding shared, civic norms. The principles of Te Tiriti o Waitangi (Te Tiriti) can also support this process by providing a distinctive, whole-of-Aotearoa New Zealand approach; one that values and

upholds the nation's bicultural foundations while embracing New Zealand's increasingly diverse future as a strength.

2. **Encouraging and facilitating positive interactions between people.** There is compelling evidence that creating opportunities for people from diverse backgrounds to positively interact with each other helps to promote more positive inter-group attitudes. The policy implications of this are wide-ranging, including the need to ensure schools, communities, workplaces, institutions and media representations better reflect New Zealand's diversity, as well as facilitating and normalising positive interactions between diverse groups.
3. **Tackling harms to inclusion, including prejudice, discrimination and other harmful behaviours.** There is clear evidence that many New Zealanders routinely experience prejudice and discrimination, which negatively affects people's wellbeing and prevents people from participating in society. This discrimination takes a variety of forms and includes not just interpersonal but also structural discrimination and prejudice. Comprehensive, evidence-based strategies and ongoing monitoring are needed to prevent and limit these impacts, especially in schools and workplaces where most prejudice and discrimination occurs.
4. **Supporting people to have the knowledge and skills they need to participate.** Ensuring equitable access to education and training, that adapts to meet people's diverse needs, is a critical long-term driver of social inclusion. An inclusive education system should give all New Zealanders the social and emotional skills needed to understand and appreciate diverse perspectives, as well as empowering people from diverse backgrounds to be able to participate socially and economically.
5. **Supporting people to have a voice and feel heard.** There is very good evidence that giving people a voice, ensuring people feel heard, and treating people fairly contributes to people's trust, civic participation, and willingness to make compromises for the common good. Providing equitable access to these opportunities to have a voice and feel heard would help start to address the marked disparities in institutional trust felt by marginalised groups.
6. **Reducing inequality and improving opportunities for people by providing support and resources.** Inequality in people's access to resources and opportunities are a fundamental brake on progress towards greater social inclusion. Redressing these inequities, especially through access to employment opportunities and ongoing reforms to the tax-transfer system, are essential for building social inclusion over the long term.

One of the challenges of building social inclusion is that it is an inherently complex process. Progress will require ongoing action across all six key areas, as well as buy-in from a range of actors, at multiple levels – from grassroots campaigns and community-led programmes right through to changes to wider policy settings and legislative safeguards.

These challenges, while significant, are arguably modest compared to the risks of assuming that social inclusion will take care of itself in the face of unprecedented social change. The evidence reviewed here instead highlights some opportunities to develop a forward-looking, evidence-informed and distinctive approach to building a more socially inclusive New Zealand.

Appendix 2: Stocktake of existing work on Social Inclusion

Here is a summary of existing work and work under development, with a rating about how strongly the work directly contributes to social inclusion (low/medium/high), against the key ways to influence social inclusion identified in MSD's evidence review.

Sharing and upholding common values and inclusive social norms

Existing work

Description	Rating	Agency
Better reflecting the diversity of the community we service – removing barriers and bias in recruitment to alter the demographics of police to be responsive to diverse communities	M	Police
Māori, Pacific and Ethnic strategies, liaison officers, and advisory forums for two way engagement with diverse communities	M	Police
Te Ara Whiti – a Ministry of Education wide programme to build a culturally responsive organisation and education system for Māori	M	MOE

Under development

Description	Rating	Agency
Child and Youth Wellbeing Strategy – provides an opportunity to describe a vision of a New Zealand where all children and young people are included in their communities	M	DPMC
Pilot cross-government intercultural competence development programme - aimed at supporting the growth and effectiveness of inclusive State sector workplaces including practical strategies to improve intercultural communication and applying an intercultural lens in their interactions with diverse colleagues and customers	M	MBIE (INZ)/ DIA/ Police
National Education Learning Priorities – sets Government priorities for Education and likely to include element of social inclusion	L/M	MOE

Encouraging and facilitating positive interactions between people

Existing work

Description	Rating	Agency
Migrant participation in host communities initiative – facilitate recent migrants' participation in the host community	H	MBIE (INZ)
Community participation services – to facilitate/support disabled people to participate in the community	H	MOH/MS D
Creative Spaces – provides funds to community arts organisations and venues that run programmes for people that might be excluded from society (eg due to mental illness, disability)	H	MSD/ MOH/ MCH
A range of small-scale initiatives aiming to increase inclusion and participation by older people, including age friendly cities programme and grants, SuperSeniors website, elder abuse services	H	MSD
Ethnic Communities Development Fund – \$520k fund for leadership development, social cohesion and cultural events	H	OEC

Description	Rating	Agency
Office for Ethnic Communities online channels – promote value of diverse communities and connections between communities	H	OEC
Community-led Development programme – long term partnership approach between DIA and communities to deliver on community-led projects with funding, advisory support, and relationship brokering	M	DIA
Community advisory, development, and support services – support for community-led approaches to work on fixing problems together	M	DIA
Welcoming Communities – supports local government councils and their communities to become more welcoming to newcomers: recent migrants, former refugees and international students	M	MBIE (INZ)
Funding of public media (including television, film and music videos) – represents diversity of communities within NZ in line with Broadcasting Act, s 36	M	MCH
Creative Communities – Creative NZ funding to councils for local arts projects in their communities that include young people	M	MCH
International student wellbeing strategy – an outcomes framework for Government agencies to coordinate efforts for International Students, includes \$760k a year for community organisations to support student wellbeing	M	MOE

Under development

Description	Rating	Agency
National dialogue events with Muslim and Interfaith Leaders, Muslim women and Muslim young people – a series of events as part of the healing process and to promote social inclusion following 15 March	H	OEC
Ethnic Communities Development Fund – one-off \$1m fund for those affected by 15 March attack for leadership development, social cohesion and cultural events	H	OEC
National Psychosocial Plan – intended to support enhanced community cohesion and social support, involving the development of activities that promote social inclusion	M/H	MOH

Supporting people to enhance their awareness, knowledge and skills across the life course

Existing work

Description	Rating	Agency
New Zealand Migrant Settlement and Integration Strategy – is the all-of-Government approach to settle and integrate recent migrants, including an Inclusion outcome	H	MBIE (INZ)
New Zealand Refugee Resettlement Strategy – is the all-of-government approach to support successful settlement outcomes for former refugees. The current cross-agency work programme includes a refugee employment project, Language Assistance Services Programme, research and settlement outcomes of refugees project, Convention Refugee Navigator, and refugee driver training programme.	H	MBIE (INZ)
National Settlement Support Services – Quota refugees are provided up to 12 months settlement support including community orientation programme and support linking to the mainstream services they need to settle	H	MBIE (INZ)

Description	Rating	Agency
Development of a big book on diversity and inclusion – ongoing development of a book targeting diversity, inclusion, challenging racism and bias for children in years 1-3	M/H	MOE
School kit – provides resources for students in years 3-9 about racism, diversity, cultural understanding and empathy	M	MOE

National Disaster Resilience Strategy – aims to build community resilience over the next ten years, with a focus on recognising social diversity and building social inclusion through the emergency management system	L/M	DPMC
Positive behaviour 4 learning – a long-term systemic approach involving ten initiatives to building positive learning environments	L/M	MOE
Wellbeing@school online survey toolkits and inclusive practice tools – survey tools to support schools to review their school climate and make changes	L/M	MOE
New Zealand Communities Football Cup – annual national football competition that provides a positive platform for engagement between police and diverse communities	L/M	Police
Te Papa – National Museum required to have regard to the ethnic and cultural diversity of NZ under Te Papa Act, s 8	L	MCH
Tuia Mātauranga – national education programme to support teaching using the themes of Tuia – Encounters 250	L	MOE

Under development

Description	Rating	Agency
Video – showcasing Mt Cook School’s approach to diversity, cultural understanding and empathy	M	MOE
School Leavers toolkit – website for students, includes section on racism and discrimination including information on rights and responsibilities and where to go for support	M	MOE
New positive ageing strategy is out for public consultation, the vision is that older New Zealanders lead valued, connected and fulfilling lives	M	MSD
Youth development funding of various community programmes aimed at youth	M	MSD
Digital inclusion - development of a blueprint about what needs to be done to ensure everyone can access the internet	L	DIA
Global resource – global and citizenship resource for years 7-10 that focuses on Te Tiriti o Waitangi, civics, climate change, environment and sustainability, and student wellbeing	L	MOE

Supporting people to have a ‘voice’, including to raise concerns and agree or disagree constructively

Existing work

Description	Rating	Agency
Local Governance for Community Wellbeing – policy settings for inclusive and effective local governance and better targeting of local public services to improve wellbeing for diverse communities	M	DIA
Human Rights Commission and Tribunal – hear complaints relating to discrimination	M	Justice

Description	Rating	Agency
Youth Voice project – which aims to build 2-way communication between young people and government agencies	M	MSD
Disabled Peoples Organisations' Coalition and independent monitoring – gives disabled people a voice in the development of policy and services	M	MSD

Under development

Description	Rating	Agency
National consultation with migrant youth - to identify their settlement challenges and needs as a first step to improving the information and services available to migrant youth to support their participation and inclusion	M	MYD/ MBIE (INZ)
Community engagement approach project – development of a community engagement approach to support refugees and wider communities to engage more effectively in the refugee quota settlement locations by enabling former refugees' voices to be heard and supporting their participation and sense of belonging	M	MBIE (INZ)
Modernising local voting – making voting more accessible for all, including disabled people and people with English as a second language including by technology	L	DIA

Reducing inequality and improving opportunities for people by providing support and resources

Existing work

Description	Rating	Agency
Delivering navigation services to support reintegration, with a focus on supporting engagement in services that support the person's return to the community, including support to maintain and enhance relationships with whānau, iwi and the wider community	M/H	Corrections
Language Assistance Services Project – an all-of-Government project to improve access to telephone interpreting and translation services for people with limited or no English language proficiency	M	MBIE (INZ)
Captioning and audio description of media – enables people who are deaf, visually or hearing impaired to access TV or radio content	M	MCH
English for speakers of other languages – programmes to learn English	M	MOE
Refugee flexible funding, careers and pathways, computers in home – additional programme for former refugee students	M	MOE
Disability employment - a range of specialist programmes and services to support disabled people to prepare for, find and stay in work	M	MSD
MSD diversity and inclusion work programme. A set of ten work programmes with an aspiration for MSD to be a trusted and proactive organisation that supports New Zealanders to thrive by tailoring our policies, systems and services to people's diverse needs	M	MSD
Rainbow Wellbeing Legacy fund – provides annual grants to support organisations that improve mental health and wellbeing outcomes in New Zealand rainbow communities, with a particular focus on supporting young people	M	MOH

Description	Rating	Agency
Māori Education Strategic Framework – tool for addressing issues and identifying opportunities for Māori education across the overall Education Work Programme, as well as providing the framework for the refresh of Ka Hikitia and Tau Mai Te Reo	L/M	MOE
Pacific Education Action Plan – focus on whole of system responses to support Pacific learners and their families to feel valued, safe and equipped to achieve their education aspirations	L/M	MOE
Māori Achievement Collectives – a professional learning and development pathway by principals for principals focussed on changing education outcomes for Māori students	L/M	MOE
Pacific Achievement Initiative – an initiative designed similar to the Māori Achievement Collectives, but to support Pacific students and contribute to linguistic and culturally sustainable practices.	L/M	MOE
Poutama Pounamu – professional learning and development initiative that seeks to address educational disparities experienced by Māori learners and whanau	L/M	MOE
MSD culture change work programme which aims to improve the services that Work and Income provides to beneficiaries	L/M	MSD
Bilingual Support Workers – to support migrant students and includes teacher aide qualifications for the workers	L/M	MOE
Child poverty measures – require Government to set and report annually on a set of child poverty measures	L	DPMC
Culture Counts – professional development focused on building success for Māori	L	MOE
Developing Mathematical Inquiry Communities – culturally responsive teaching of maths for Pacific learners	L	MOE
E Tū Whānau and Pasefika Proud – community led programmes to positively change behaviour, attitudes and norms to improve wellbeing and reduce family violence (refugees and migrants are also involved)	L	MSD

Under development

Description	Rating	Agency
Disability Strategy and action plan which aims to give effect to the Government's commitment to progressing disabled people's rights and opportunities	M/H	MSD
Hapaitia programme to transform the criminal justice system	M	Justice
Welfare system overhaul includes potential changes to core income support settings and additional support for employment	M	MSD
Pacific Education Action Plan – focus on whole of system responses to support Pacific learners and their families to feel valued, safe and equipped to achieve their education aspirations	L/M	MOE
Development of a culturally responsive long-term national strategy and action plan to eliminate family violence, sexual violence and violence towards whanau	L/M	Joint venture
MSD is developing Māori and Pacific Strategies and Action Plans to help them improve the way they work with Māori/ Pasefika	L/M	MSD

Description	Rating	Agency
Māori Health Action Plan - the Ministry of Health is developing a plan to improve health outcomes for Māori	L/M	MOH
Pacific Health Action Plan - the Ministry of Health is developing a plan to improve health outcomes for Pacific peoples	L/M	MOH

Tackling harms to inclusion, including prejudice, discrimination, privilege and harmful behaviours

Existing work

Description	Rating	Agency
Tackling casual racism campaign – Human Rights Commission “give nothing to racism “ campaign	H	HRC/ Justice
Human Rights Act 1993 – prohibits discrimination	H	Justice
Review of Harmful Digital Communications Act 2015	M	Justice
Terrorism Suppression Act – prescribes terrorism offences and Justice is considering whether it is fit for purpose	M	Justice
Race Unity Speech Awards – national speech contest and youth hui where students in years 11-13 get to meet and talk about racism and discrimination	M	OEC/ Police
District Safety Patrols – enabling migrant volunteers in Hamilton, Wellington and Christchurch to be trained and work alongside the NZ Police to contribute to safety in the community	M	Police
Ethnic Patrols – Police have introduced ethnic patrols in some of our districts to assist in developing trust and confidence within the migrant population. The Wellington patrol has more than 60 members, speaking at least a dozen languages between them	M	Police
Continuous implementation of UN conventions – complying and reporting under various UN human rights conventions	L	Justice

Under development

Description	Rating	Agency
Countering violent extremism online – operational and legislative responses (immediate and long term work programme) to stop violent extremist content on mainstream social media platforms	H	DPMC/DIA
Hate speech – review of approaches to hate speech	H	Justice
Optional Protocol to the Budapest Convention on Cybercrime – criminalisation of racist acts committed through computers	H	Justice
9(2)(f)(iv)		
Migrants’ experience of discrimination - this research will provide up-to-date evidence about the experiences of discrimination of New Zealand’s migrant community to inform targeted interventions to address discrimination	M	HRC
Control order regime – managing people who present a terrorism risk	M	Justice
Temporary Migrant Exploitation Review - to reduce temporary migrant worker exploitation	M	MBIE
Description	Rating	Agency
Te Hurihanganui – a three year trial in 6-8 communities to address racism and cultural bias in the education system (with initial focus on Māori)	M	MOE
9(2)(f)(iv)		
Response to the Inquiry into Mental Health and Addictions – involves the expansion of access and choice of mental health and addiction services, including activities to reduce stigma and promote inclusion. Could be expanded but focus is on mental health and wellbeing	M	MOH

Multi-agency coordination and intervention programme – to support co-ordinated, outcomes-focused intervention of individuals of violent extremist concern including early engagement of services	M	Police
Unconscious bias programme – promote fairness in all decision making through education and training, and review of policies, processes and operational processes	M	Police
Issues paper on workplace bullying and harassment	L/M	MBIE
Gender identity – practical improvements to remove barrier to changing sex on birth certificates for transgender individuals	L	DIA

Proactively Released



Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee

Minute of Decision

This document contains information for the New Zealand Cabinet. It must be treated in confidence and handled in accordance with any security classification, or other endorsement. The information can only be released, including under the Official Information Act 1982, by persons with the appropriate authority.

Improving Social Inclusion Post the 15 March Terror Attacks


Portfolio Prime Minister

On 11 September 2019, the Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee:

- 1 **noted** that demographic changes and migration are contributing to increasingly diverse communities in New Zealand;
- 2 **noted** that the government already has a lot of work underway across a range of policy areas to improve social inclusion across New Zealand;
- 3 **noted** that there are reasons to consider if the government wants to do more post the events of 15 March, including in the context of the commitments the government has made in the Christchurch Call Action to Eliminate Terrorist and Violent Extremist Content online;
- 4 **noted** that the Prime Minister has asked the Department of Prime Minister and Cabinet to lead some work to review the evidence on social inclusion, identify work underway across government, and provide some advice on potential interventions to strengthen social inclusion;
- 5 **agreed** to leverage some of the existing interventions to:
 - 5.1 reduce discrimination in our communities;
 - 5.2 show government and public service leadership on social inclusion;
 - 5.3 support community-based activities that promote an inclusive national identity; and
 - 5.4 strengthen our focus on equity and social inclusion in priority work programmes;
- 6 **noted** that Cabinet has already approved some of these interventions, including expanding funding for the ‘give nothing to racism’ campaign, expanding the welcoming communities programme, and the development of an employment strategy action plan for refugees, recent migrants and ethnic communities;
- 7 **agreed** to explore a small number of additional interventions, with a strong focus on children and young people, that could have a significant impact, including:

9(2)(f)(iv)

9(2)(f)(iv)



- 7.4 increasing understanding of local and national history;
- 8 **invited** the Minister of Social Development to lead the development of a report-back, with all Ministers responsible for actions identified in paragraphs 5, 6, and 7, to the Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee by the end of 2019, on progress including design and an assessment of resourcing, costs, benefits and risks of additional interventions;
- 9 **agreed** that the Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee will maintain oversight of this work;
- 10 **agreed** to include this work in the government's regular monitoring of the response to the 15 March Terror Attacks for the Cabinet Priorities Committee;
- 11 **noted** that the Ministry of Social Development will coordinate this work following decisions on the paper under SWC-19-SUB-0126.

Vivien Meek
Committee Secretary

Present:

Rt Hon Jacinda Ardern
Hon Kelvin Davis
Hon Dr Megan Woods
Hon Chris Hipkins
Hon Andrew Little
Hon Carmel Sepuloni (Chair)
Hon Dr David Clark
Hon Nanaia Mahuta
Hon Stuart Nash
Hon Jenny Salesa
Hon Kris Faafoi
Hon Tracey Martin
Hon Peeni Henare
Hon Aupito William Sio
Hon Poto Williams
Jan Logie, MP

Officials present from:

Office of the Prime Minister
Officials Committee for SWC
Office of the Chair of SWC

Hard-copy distribution:

Prime Minister



Cabinet

Minute of Decision

This document contains information for the New Zealand Cabinet. It must be treated in confidence and handled in accordance with any security classification, or other endorsement. The information can only be released, including under the Official Information Act 1982, by persons with the appropriate authority.

Report of the Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee: Period Ended 13 September 2019

On 16 September 2019, Cabinet made the following decisions on the work of the Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee for the period ended 13 September 2019:

Out of scope




SWC-19-MIN-0126 **Improving Social Inclusion Post the 15 March Terror Attacks** CONFIRMED
Portfolio: Prime Minister

Out of scope



Out of scope



Michael Webster
Secretary of the Cabinet

Hard-copy distribution:
Cabinet Social Wellbeing Committee

Proactively Released